

Terms of Reference (ToRs)

Third Party Firm for Verification of Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) For the Sindh Enhancing Response to Reduce Stunting Project (SERRSP)

I. Project Background and Description

For decades, Pakistan has had persistently high rates of stunting (and other forms of malnutrition) and currently has the third highest number of stunted children in the world. Sindh's nutrition indicators are among the worst in the country, with negligible improvement since 2001. 48% of all children under five in Sindh suffer from stunting (MICS 2014).

Vitamin A deficiency and anemia among children under five are at 53 percent and 73 percent, respectively, with the latter about 10 percentage points above the national average. Over the past decade, increasing household food insecurity, poor quality and quantity of water, suboptimal sanitation and hygiene practices including open defecation, early and frequent childbearing as well as low literacy rates have all contributed to this trend. To address the dilemma, the Government of Sindh has approved an Accelerated Action Plan for Reduction of Stunting and Malnutrition (AAP) with the ambitious goal of reducing stunting from 48% to 30% by 2021. The Government has requested the World Bank support in achieving this goal through the implementation of the AAP during 2017-2021.

The World Bank - financed project titled "Sindh Enhancing Response to Reduce Stunting Project (SERRSP)" will support the AAP implementation in 23 districts with the highest stunting rates through a results-based approach to link disbursements to the achievement of results against agreed indicators. The project comprises two components. The first component, through a results-based approach using disbursement linked indicators (DLIs), will finance results set out in the AAP while the second component will finance technical assistance and other inputs needed for effective implementation of the AAP. Under Component 1, the project will support provision of a multisectoral package of service by financing results, measured by the achievement of DLIs, under a defined Eligible Expenditure Program (EEP).

Under Component 2, the project will finance technical assistance and input to support (i) measures for implementing a pilot conditional cash transfer (CCT) program to assist targeted beneficiaries in the poorest quintile to access health and nutrition services; (ii) development and implementation of an overarching multi-sectoral communication strategy for social and behavioral change; and (iii) institutional arrangement for improving coordination, strengthening accountability citizen engagement, operationalizing integrated multi-sectoral data information systems, strengthening monitoring, evaluation and supervision.

II. Project Development Objective

The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to contribute to the reduction of the stunting among children under 05 years of age by targeting the most affected districts in the Province of Sindh.

Reduction of stunting requires a multisectoral response. Achieving the PDO relies on a theory of change that envisages improved child nutrition, growth, and cognition through (i) improved dietary intake and (ii) reduced disease burden. These outcomes rely on improved maternal and child nutrition achieved by enhancing the coverage of health related nutrition services; reduced exposure to fecal pathogens through better hygiene and sanitation practices; and improved quality and diversification of dietary practices. The interventions prioritized by this project which supports the Government's AAP are the most critical and effective interventions (nutrition specific and nutrition sensitive) leading to outcomes which contribute to reducing childhood stunting. These interventions will be implemented through the health/population, sanitation, social protection, education and agriculture sectors.

III. Disbursement Linked Indicators

Under component 1 of the SERRSP, the project funds (approx. USD 45 million) will be released against the achievements of the 'DLIs. DLIs have been used in other projects in Sindh and have contributed significantly to (i) enhance policy and sector dialogue (by focusing on political ownership of the Government's program); (ii) have a greater focus on results (by linking disbursements to planned progress and performance targets); and (iii) have more effective donor coordination (by facilitating planning, budgeting, and supervision within a common framework).

There are six DLIs under Component 1. Three of them are divided into two sub-indicators (DLIs 1, 2, and 3), and one has three sub-indicators (DLI 6). The DLI targets are defined for every year of implementation, 2017/2018, 2018/19, 2019/20 and 2020/21. Annex1 provides the defined DLI matrix, annual target and the planned disbursements against each DLI. The achievements of the targets for each DLI will be verified by a third-party verification firm and submitted to the AAP Task Force Secretariat on a bi-annual basis. The AAP Task Force Secretariat will provide the verification reports to the World Bank on a bi-annual basis. The World Bank will release the funds to the Government of Pakistan upon the confirmation of the achievement of the DLI targets as verified by the third-party verification firm.

IV. Objectives and Scope of the Consultancy

The purpose of this assignment is to conduct an independent verification of achievement progress on the DLIs before any disbursement under Component 1 which is a DLI category

of expenditure. This consultancy aims to: (i) design evaluation methodology for verification of the progress made on DLIs by different sectors; (ii) conduct the verification in a transparent and independent manner such that it provides the robust evidence for decision makers; and(iii) submit and present results and all related information and analysis to the AAP Task Force Secretariat.

V. Tasks of the Consultancy

Main tasks are:

1. Design and prepare a detailed verification protocol and tools for assessing each of the DLIs against their respective timeline (two assessments per year), the questionnaires and the templates for data processing and finalize in coordination with AAP Task Force Secretariat.
2. Conduct the verification of each DLI according to the DLI schedule or as may be required by the AAP Task Force Secretariat from time to time over the period of life of the project.
3. Submit draft verification reports to the AAP Secretariat within fifteen working days after the verification of results, in accordance with the agreed template. Over the four years of implementation, at least eight bi annual reports and one summary report will need to be prepared and submitted. The reports should present, but not be limited to: summary of the process of DLI verification and assessment, procedures for quality control, the results of the DLI achievements, summaries of major discrepancies between target and actual achievements, short analysis of reasons for discrepancies and recommendations supporting management decisions for adjustments when and where needed.
4. Submit draft reports to the AAP Task Force Secretariat for review and comments.
5. Based on feedback and discussions with the AAP Secretariat, finalize the DLI verification report, and submit final verification report to the AAP Task Force Secretariat. The AAP Task Force Secretariat will submit the report to the World Bank.

VI. Deliverables

The DLI verification process will be in accordance with the relevant section of the SERRSP Operations Manual. The selected firm will submit the listed deliverables to the AAP Task Force Secretariat in a timely manner following the agreed-on timelines and work plan. The deliverables will be reviewed and approved by the AAP Task Force Secretariat for onwards submission to the World Bank for disbursements.

Though the TORs cover the entire verification period of four years, the below mentioned deliverables focus on the initial two rounds of verification exercises. The contract will be awarded to complete the initial 1st year covering two rounds of verification exercises. Please find details for submission of deliverable and payment schedule at Annex 2 of the TORs.

1. Inception report with a detailed work plan, staffing plan, methodology for assessing the status and achievements of those DLIs, on a biannual basis, verification protocol for assessing each of the DLIs against their respective timeline (two assessments per year), the questionnaires and the templates for data processing and finalize in coordination with AAP Task Force Secretariat.
2. Summary note of the implementation of the verification exercise (1st round, 2017-2018)
3. Draft of 1st Verification Report (2017/18)
4. Final draft 1st Verification Report and complete data set after incorporation of feedback of Taskforce Secretariat
5. Summary note of the implementation of the verification exercise (2st Round, 2018/19)
6. Draft of 2nd Verification Report (2018/19)
7. Final draft 2nd Verification Report and complete data set after incorporation of feedback of Taskforce Secretariat

VII. Contract Period

The firm shall be contracted for one year. As per the list of deliverables, all work to be completed as per listed in Annex-2

VIII. Qualifications

1. Ten years overall experience with five years in monitoring, assessing, validation/verification of indicators and evaluating public and/or private sector community development and facility based social service programs of scale. Experience in verifying and tracking DLIs for disbursements based on results achievements as relevant to the TORs will be preferred.
2. Documented experience of developing M&E indicators, tools and systems measuring target achievements of large scale community-based development and facility based social services programs.
3. Verifiable statistical and research, monitoring and evaluation expertise, as relevant to the TORs.
4. Documented experience of preparing quality reports which are concise and succinct to allow policy and technical decisions.

1. Minimum Qualifications of Proposed Team to be Deployed

The proposed team to be deployed should have experience in information management, statistics, data analysis, general project management as relevant to the TORs. The firm should also have documented capacity to mobilize additional expertise within the project areas as required in a timely and efficient manner. At the minimum, the consulting firm shall depute following experts to the project:

- i. Team leader with master's degree in development field, social science or relevant discipline and 10 years working experience in performance management plan and project-level monitoring and evaluation plans; supporting project design including indicator development, study design, and data analysis in multiple sectors.
- ii. One specialist with master's degree in development field, social science or relevant discipline with 10 years of similar working experience in development, deployment and maintenance of a robust and independent system of validation and preparation of verification reports. Specialist having.
- iii. Two specialists having master's degree in development field, social science or relevant discipline and at least 05 years of similar working experience with appropriate support staff to assist in reviewing work plans, reports, participating in field visits, initiating regular portfolio reviews and contributing to DLIs evaluations.
- iv. One IT Manager having master's degree in computer science, software engineering or relevant discipline with at least 05 years working experience in integrating data, analysis and maintaining system for reporting the progress of DLIs or M&E indicators

IX. Selection Process

A consultancy firm will be selected in accordance with the procedures set out in the World Bank's Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers (2016) [Procurement Regulations 2016] through Least Cost-based Selection method in accordance with paragraph 7.6 of Procurement Regulations 2016.

ANNEX 1: DISBURSEMENT-LINKED INDICATORS MATRIX

Indicators of DLI Achievement and Indicative Disbursements (US\$ Million)

LI	Total (\$US million)		2017-2018			2018-2019			2019-2020		2020-2021		
	Amount	%	Baseline	Target	Achievement	Amount	Target	Achievement	Amount	Target	Amount	Target	
1a	7.0	16%	0	350 000	56310 by CMWs, 650023 by LHWs .Total 706333	1.0	725 000	180459 (progress till November 2018)	1.5	1 100 000	2.0	1 525 000	2.5
Definition/Description of Achievement:		Cumulative number of pregnant women in the intervention areas who received at least four prenatal care visits at the community level.											
1b	7.0	16%	0	190 000	1052880 (More target achieved	1.0	415 000	88,720(progresstill November 2018)	1.5	675 000	2.0	1 000 000	2.5
Definition/Description of Achievement:		The cumulative number of pregnant women in the intervention areas receiving at least four antenatal care visits at primary health care facilities (BHU, RHC, THQ, and DHQ).											
	7.0	16%	0	575 000	691853(More target achieved)	1.3	700 000	712852(progress till November 2018)	2.6	600 000	5.2	280 000	
Definition/Description of Achievement:		Cumulative number of children 6-59 mos. screened (MUAC) at community level. Limited to districts covered by the Nutrition Support Program (NSP).											
2b						1.0			1.5		2.0		2.5

	malnourished children aged 6-59 months who	7.0	16%	0	95 000	139136 (More target achieved)	135 000	59832	310 000			320 000	
	are registered in Outpatient Therapeutic Program (OTP) centers at health facilities and mobile health clinics												
	Definition/Description of Achievement:	Cumulative number of children 6-59 mos.	screened (MUAC)	by LHW	and CMW at	Community level. Limited to districts covered by the Nutrition Support Program (NSP).							
	Cumulative no. of villages certified open defecation free			14%									
3a	No. of signed NGO contracts	1.5		0	2	2	0.5	5	In progress	0.5	10	0.5	
3b	Cumulative number of villages certified ODF	5.0			400	Not achieved	0.5	2 200	In progress	1.0	5 400	1.5	8,600 2
	Definition/Description of Achievement:	Contract signature indicating recruitment				of the NGO to support the initiative followed by certification of Open Defecation Free (ODF) villages.							
4	Introduction of nutrition and life-skills curriculum/instructional materials in Grades 6-10	2.00	4%		Curriculum	Not achieved	2.0		Not achieved				
	Definition/Description of Achievement:					Development of a curriculum and instructional materials, teacher training, and introduction in Grades 6-10 of (primarily) female schools.							
5	Implementation of a												

	province-wide, multi-sectoral media/		4%									
	communications campaign											
	Adoption of BCC plan / Launch of campaign	2.0		Plan	Achieved	0.5	Campaign	No progress	1.5			
	Definition/Description of Achievement:			adopted			launched					
				Adoption of the BCC plan followed by launch of the campaign described in the plan.								
	% of allocated nutrition financing actually expended		14%		0							
6a	Amount of nutrition-related releases for AAP by June 30	2.0		500M PKR	1550 M PKR (More target achieved)	1.0	500M PKR	1318 M PKR	1.0			
6b	Establishment of nutrition expenditure tracking program	1.5					Functional	No progress	1.5			
6c	Annual amount of nutrition-related expenditures by AAP sector	3.0			1162 M PKR			Rs: 34.33 Millions	XXX	1.5	XXX	1.5
									Annual amount		to be calculated after the tracking system is functional	

Annex 2: Deliverable, timelines and payment schedule

Please note: The initial contract will be issued for duration of one year covering 2 rounds of verification exercises and reports. Based on satisfactory performance the contract will be extended to sub-subsequent years up to 2021. All deliverables are subject to acceptance by the Task force secretariat before payment process.

S. No	Deliverables	Suggested Deadline for submission of deliverable	Payment (% age of total Contract value)	Remarks
1	Designing and preparation of a detailed verification protocol for assessing each of the DLIs against their respective timeline, the questionnaires and the templates for data processing and finalize in coordination with AAP Task Force Secretariat.	Within 30calendar days of signing of contract	10%	
2	Summary note of the implementation of the verification exercise (1 st Round, 2017-2018)	60 days of contract signing	10%	
3	Draft of 1 st Verification Report (2017/18)	120 days of contract signing	15%	
4	Submission and acceptance of final 1 st Verification Report and complete data set	Four weeks after submission of draft 1 st Verification Report, but no later than 150 days of contract signing	20%	
5	Summary note of the implementation of the verification exercise (2 st Round, 2018/19)	Within 160 days of contract signing	10%	
6	Draft of 2 nd Verification Report (2018/19)	220 days of contract signing	15%	
7	Submission and acceptance of final 2 st Verification Report and complete data set	Four weeks after submission of draft 2 nd Verification Report, but no later than 250 days of contract signing.	20%	

BRIEF NOTE ON THE SECTORS PARTICIPATING IN THE ACCELERATED ACTION PLAN UNDER TASK FORCE SECRETARIATE

- Health and Nutrition: The Department of Health (DOH) has developed an overall estimate of PKR 20 Billion for Accelerated Action Plan for reducing Stunting and Malnutrition with a number of projects on development budget that deal with the objective. These activity will be enhanced through the allocation of funds in addition to on-going development budget programs, the department will provide incremental allocation through its recurrent budget. This will require innovative means for linking plans and budgets and preparing budget execution reports. A suggested method of putting together recurrent and development budget is through output based budgeting, a system of budgeting which is in use in the federal government in the form of Budget Estimates for Service Delivery
- Population: The GoS has developed a costed implementation plan to meet the Family Planning (FP) 2020 targets, which would also be critical to reducing levels of stunting. The plan for 10 districts is currently under implementation with a limited set of activities which are planned to be scaled up under the AAP. This project will incentivize the training of LHWs to provide FP counselling and supply of short term methods as well as special outreach FP services delivery camps to communities currently not reached with FP services.
- Sanitation and Hygiene: Building on the proposed Multi-Sectoral Actions for Nutrition Project (MSAN) in 13 districts to make villages open defecation free (ODF), the AAP plans to expand coverage across Sindh. In addition to supporting the ODF initiative, the project will promote an enhanced program on handwashing through capacity development of the Local Government Department (LGD), Village Organizations (VO) and school teachers who, in turn, will advocate and motivate communities to become 100% ODF. As suggested earlier, each of the department will require capacity of managing activities not only from development budget programs but also three AAP allocation of recurrent budget.
- Agriculture (including Livestock and Fisheries): Building on a flexible and demand driven approach to be piloted in 20 uncouncils of four districts under the proposed MSAN Project, the department plans to gradually scale up to more districts with a high incidence of stunting. The focus will be on nutrition sensitive interventions that would contribute to enhancing household food diversity and access to high nutritive value foods, especially for the poorest and most food insecure households, and to consumption of high nutrition content food, especially by pregnant-nursing women, children under five and adolescents.
- Education: The two key interventions in the AAP are: (i) to improve access to Early Childhood Education (ECE) in the public schools and (ii) to improve knowledge of nutrition and healthy living among girls enrolled in high schools in the public sector. There is a need to develop curriculum and supplementary material for training of teachers and adolescent girls in schools. ELD is also operating an IT citizen engagement platform (“Ilmi”) that could be used to further engage the larger

community on the stunting agenda (including the importance of early stimulation of babies) by engaging School Management Committees (which include teachers, parents and administrators). This IT platform which provides useful education-related data could also be expanded to include data needs of other multisectoral interventions.

- Social Welfare: The other sectoral interventions (social and behavioral change communications) are cross cutting in nature and will target the entire province. The number of project beneficiaries in the 23 priority districts is expected to more than double by the end of the project, with coverage increasing from 20.5% to 44.7% of the targeted populations. Main objective of the Health & Nutrition Conditional Cash Transfer is to create demand for nutrition services, promote behavioural change and increase uptake of health and nutrition services focused on the first 1,000 days of life.

It aims to incentivize health check-ups of pregnant and lactating mothers, and growth monitoring and immunization of children less than 2 years of age, by providing a regular and predictable cash transfers to targeted poor and vulnerable households. It will promote growth monitoring and immunization of children under 2 years of age. Beneficiaries would be selected from the existing cohort of poverty targeted beneficiary families identified from the National Socio-Economic Registry and would receive regular and predictable cash transfers.